## Center-based Clustering

2-approximation for $k$-center clustering
5-approximation for $k$-median clustering
$k$-means clustering

## Center-based clustering - intuition

Given: integer $k$, point set $P$


## Center-based clustering - intuition

## $k=4$



Given: integer $k$, point set $P$
Goal: point set $C$, of size $k$ such that every point in P is close to a point in $C$

## Center-based clustering - intuition

## $k=4$

Given: integer $k$, point set $P$


Goal: point set $C$, of size $k$ such that every point in P is close to a point in $C$

## Motivation:

- placing facilities, e.g., hospitals
- finding groups of nearby points


## Center-based clustering - intuition

## $k=4$

Goal: point set $C$, of size $k$ such that every point in P is close to a point in $C$

## Motivation:

- placing facilities, e.g., hospitals
- finding groups of nearby points


## Preliminaries

metric space: pair $(X, d)$ with $X$ a set, and $d: X \times X \rightarrow[0, \infty)$ satisfying

## Preliminaries

metric space: pair $(X, d)$ with $X$ a set, and $d: X \times X \rightarrow[0, \infty)$ satisfying $d(x, y)=0$ if and only if $x=y$,

## Preliminaries

metric space: pair $(X, d)$ with $X$ a set, and $d: X \times X \rightarrow[0, \infty)$ satisfying

$$
\begin{aligned}
& d(x, y)=0 \text { if and only if } x=y \\
& d(x, y)=d(y, x)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Preliminaries

metric space: pair $(X, d)$ with $X$ a set, and $d: X \times X \rightarrow[0, \infty)$ satisfying

$$
\begin{aligned}
& d(x, y)=0 \text { if and only if } x=y \\
& d(x, y)=d(y, x) \\
& d(x, z) \leq d(x, y)+d(y, z) . \quad(\text { triangle inequality })
\end{aligned}
$$



## Preliminaries

metric space: pair $(X, d)$ with $X$ a set, and $d: X \times X \rightarrow[0, \infty)$ satisfying

$$
\begin{aligned}
& d(x, y)=0 \text { if and only if } x=y \\
& d(x, y)=d(y, x)
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
d(x, z) \leq d(x, y)+d(y, z) . \quad \text { (triangle inequality) }
$$



## examples:

$R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance

## Preliminaries

metric space: pair $(X, d)$ with $X$ a set, and $d: X \times X \rightarrow[0, \infty)$ satisfying

$$
\begin{aligned}
& d(x, y)=0 \text { if and only if } x=y \\
& d(x, y)=d(y, x) \\
& d(x, z) \leq d(x, y)+d(y, z) . \quad \text { (triangle inequality) }
\end{aligned}
$$



## examples:

$R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance
Graph with shortest-path distance


## Preliminaries

metric space: pair $(X, d)$ with $X$ a set, and $d: X \times X \rightarrow[0, \infty)$ satisfying

$$
\begin{aligned}
& d(x, y)=0 \text { if and only if } x=y \\
& d(x, y)=d(y, x) \\
& d(x, z) \leq d(x, y)+d(y, z) . \quad \text { (triangle inequality) }
\end{aligned}
$$



## examples:

$R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance
Graph with shortest-path distance curves with Fréchet distance

## Preliminaries

metric space: pair $(X, d)$ with $X$ a set, and $d: X \times X \rightarrow[0, \infty)$ satisfying

$$
\begin{aligned}
d(x, y) & =0 \text { if and only if } x=y \\
d(x, y) & =d(y, x) \\
d(x, z) & \leq d(x, y)+d(y, z) . \quad \text { (triangle inequality) }
\end{aligned}
$$



## examples:

$R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance
Graph with shortest-path distance curves with Fréchet distance
notation: $d(p, C):=\min _{q \in C} d(p, q)$
$k$-center clustering in metric space $(X, d)$
Given: $P \subset X$ and integer $k$
Goal: Find $C \subset X$ of size $k$ such that

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C)
$$

is minimized.
$k$-center clustering in metric space $(X, d)$
Given: $P \subset X$ and integer $k$
Goal: Find $C \subset X$ of size $k$ such that

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C)
$$

is minimized.

## $k$-center clustering in metric space $(X, d)$

Given: $P \subset X$ and integer $k$
Goal: Find $C \subset X$ of size $k$ such that

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C)
$$

is minimized.
discrete $k$-center problem: $C \subset P$
$k$-center clustering in metric space $(X, d)$
Given: $P \subset X$ and integer $k$
Goal: Find $C \subset X$ of size $k$ such that

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C)
$$


is minimized.
discrete $k$-center problem: $C \subset P$

## $k$-center clustering in metric space $(X, d)$

Given: $P \subset X$ and integer $k$
Goal: Find $C \subset X$ of size $k$ such that

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C)
$$

is minimized.
discrete $k$-center problem: $C \subset P$

## later:

(discrete) $k$-median problem: sum instead of max
$k$-means: sum of squares

## Quiz

Which of the following is an optimal set of centers for $k=3$ ?


## Quiz

Which of the following is an optimal set of centers for $k=3$ ?


## Quiz

Which of the following is an optimal set of centers for $k=3$ ?


| A | $4,10,16$ |
| :--- | :--- |
| B | $6,12,15$ |
| C | $7,13,16$ |

## Quiz

Which of the following is an optimal set of centers for $k=3$ ?
$k$-center clustering
approximation algorithm

## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

Incrementally add points to $C$. How can we guarantee to reduce the maximum?


## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

Incrementally add points to $C$. How can we guarantee to reduce the maximum?


Add the point $p$ with maximum $d(p, C)$ !

## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
4: Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
6: return $C_{k}$


## Algorithm GreedyKCenter( $P, k$ )

$\longrightarrow$ 1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
4: Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
6: return $C_{k}$



## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
$\longrightarrow$ 2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
4: Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
6: return $C_{k}$



## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
$\longrightarrow 4$ : Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
6: return $C_{k}$


## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
4: Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
$\longrightarrow$ 5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
6: return $C_{k}$


## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
$\longrightarrow 4$ : Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
6: return $C_{k}$


## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
4: Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
$\longrightarrow$ 5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
6: return $C_{k}$


## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
$\longrightarrow 4$ : Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
6: return $C_{k}$


## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
4: Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
$\longrightarrow$ 5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
6: return $C_{k}$




## Algorithm GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$

1: $c_{1} \leftarrow$ arbitrary point of $P$
2: $C_{1} \leftarrow\left\{c_{1}\right\}$
3: for $i=2,3, \ldots, k$ :
4: Let $c_{i} \in P$ be the point such that $d\left(c_{i}, C_{i-1}\right)$ is maximal
5: $\quad C_{i} \leftarrow C_{i-1} \cup s_{i}$
$\longrightarrow$ 6: return $C_{k}$


## Approximation factor

GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$ computes a 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering.

## Approximation factor

## GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$ computes a 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering.

$C^{*}$ : an optimal solution with $O P T:=\max _{p \in P} d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$C_{k}=\left\{c_{1}, \ldots, c_{k}\right\}$ computed solution


## Approximation factor

## GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$ computes a 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering.

$C^{*}$ : an optimal solution with $O P T:=\max _{p \in P} d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$C_{k}=\left\{c_{1}, \ldots, c_{k}\right\}$ computed solution
$c_{k+1}$ : point maximizing $d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=: r$


## Approximation factor

## GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$ computes a 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering.

$C^{*}$ : an optimal solution with $O P T:=\max _{p \in P} d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$C_{k}=\left\{c_{1}, \ldots, c_{k}\right\}$ computed solution
$c_{k+1}$ : point maximizing $d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=: r$

```
for \(i<j\) :
\(d\left(c_{j}, c_{i}\right) \geq d\left(c_{j}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=r\)
```


## Approximation factor

## GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$ computes a 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering.

$C^{*}$ : an optimal solution with $O P T:=\max _{p \in P} d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$C_{k}=\left\{c_{1}, \ldots, c_{k}\right\}$ computed solution
$c_{k+1}$ : point maximizing $d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=: r$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { for } i<j \text { : } \\
& d\left(c_{j}, c_{i}\right) \geq d\left(c_{j}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=r \\
& \quad c_{i} \in C_{j-1}
\end{aligned}
$$



## Approximation factor

## GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$ computes a 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering.

$C^{*}$ : an optimal solution with $O P T:=\max _{p \in P} d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$C_{k}=\left\{c_{1}, \ldots, c_{k}\right\}$ computed solution
$c_{k+1}$ : point maximizing $d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=: r$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { for } i<j \text { : } \\
& \qquad d\left(c_{j}, c_{i}\right) \geq d\left(c_{j}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=r \\
& c_{i} \in C_{j-1} \quad \begin{array}{l}
c_{j} \text { had max } \\
\\
\quad \begin{array}{l}
\text { distance in } \\
\text { iteration } j
\end{array}
\end{array}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Approximation factor

## GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$ computes a 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering.

$C^{*}$ : an optimal solution with $O P T:=\max _{p \in P} d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$C_{k}=\left\{c_{1}, \ldots, c_{k}\right\}$ computed solution
$c_{k+1}$ : point maximizing $d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=: r$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { for } i<j \text { : } \\
& d\left(c_{j}, c_{i}\right) \geq d\left(c_{j}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=r \\
& c_{i} \in C_{j-1} \quad \begin{array}{l}
c_{j} \text { had } \max \quad C_{j-1} \subset C_{k} \\
\\
\\
\\
\\
\text { itstantion in } j
\end{array}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Approximation factor

## GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$ computes a 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering.

$C^{*}$ : an optimal solution with $O P T:=\max _{p \in P} d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$C_{k}=\left\{c_{1}, \ldots, c_{k}\right\}$ computed solution
$c_{k+1}$ : point maximizing $d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=: r$

pigeonhole principle:


## Approximation factor

GreedyKCenter $(P, k)$ computes a 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering.
$C^{*}$ : an optimal solution with $O P T:=\max _{p \in P} d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$C_{k}=\left\{c_{1}, \ldots, c_{k}\right\}$ computed solution
$c_{k+1}$ : point maximizing $d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=: r$

```
for \(i<j\) :
\(d\left(c_{j}, c_{i}\right) \geq d\left(c_{j}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{j-1}\right) \geq d\left(c_{k+1}, C_{k}\right)=r\)
```

pigeonhole principle:

$k=4$
$\exists c_{i}, c_{j}$ in the same cluster of $C^{*} ; o:=$ corresponding center
triangle inequality:
$r \leq d\left(c_{j}, c_{i}\right) \leq d\left(c_{j}, o\right)+d\left(o, c_{i}\right) \leq 2 O P T$

## Quiz

The proof that GreedyKCenter gives a 2-approximation works . . .
A only in $R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance
B in $R^{d}$ but only with Euclidean distance
C in any metric space

The proof that GreedyKCenter gives a 2-approximation works . . .
A only in $R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance
B in $R^{d}$ but only with Euclidean distance
C in any metric space
since it only uses the triangle inequality

## Quiz

The proof that GreedyKCenter gives a 2-approximation works . . .
A only in $R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance
B in $R^{d}$ but only with Euclidean distance
C in any metric space
since it only uses the triangle inequality
When $k$ is part of the input, the $k$-center problem is
NP-hard to approximate within a factor
$2-\varepsilon$ for general metric spaces

The proof that GreedyKCenter gives a 2-approximation works . . .
A only in $R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance
B in $R^{d}$ but only with Euclidean distance
C in any metric space
since it only uses the triangle inequality
When $k$ is part of the input, the $k$-center problem is
NP-hard to approximate within a factor
$2-\varepsilon$ for general metric spaces
1.82 for $R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance

## Quiz

The proof that GreedyKCenter gives a 2-approximation works . . .
A only in $R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance
B in $R^{d}$ but only with Euclidean distance
C in any metric space
since it only uses the triangle inequality
When $k$ is part of the input, the $k$-center problem is
NP-hard to approximate within a factor
$2-\varepsilon$ for general metric spaces
1.82 for $R^{2}$ with Euclidean distance
$2-\varepsilon$ for $R^{2}$ with $L_{1}$ - or $L_{\infty}$ - distance
discrete $k$-median clustering
approximation algorithm

## discrete $k$-median clustering in metric space $(X, d)$

Given: $P \subset X$ and integer $k$
Goal: Find $C \subset P$ of size $k$ such that

$$
\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)
$$

is minimized.

## discrete $k$-median clustering in metric space $(X, d)$

Given: $P \subset X$ and integer $k$
Goal: Find $C \subset P$ of size $k$ such that

$$
\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)
$$

is minimized.

## Question $(k=3)$

Which set $C$ of 3 points minimizes $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ ?


## Question $(k=3)$

Which set $C$ of 3 points minimizes $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ ?


## Question $(k=3)$

Which set $C$ of 3 points minimizes $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ ?

good? $\{3,12,18\},\{7,13,16\}$ optimal: $\{3,10,16\}$

## GreedyKCenter for $k$-median?

Use 2 -approximation for $k$-center clustering (?) on $n$ points

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} \max _{p \in P}=n \cdot \max _{p \in P}
$$

## GreedyKCenter for $k$-median?

Use 2 -approximation for $k$-center clustering (?) on $n$ points

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} \max _{p \in P}=n \cdot \max _{p \in P}
$$

## GreedyKCenter for $k$-median?

Use 2 -approximation for $k$-center clustering (?) on $n$ points

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} \max _{p \in P}=n \cdot \max _{p \in P}
$$

This means:
optimal solution to $k$-center clustering is $n$-approximation for $k$-median

## GreedyKCenter for $k$-median?

Use 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering (?) on $n$ points

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} \max _{p \in P}=n \cdot \max _{p \in P}
$$

This means:
optimal solution to $k$-center clustering is $n$-approximation for $k$-median
2 -approximation for $k$-center clustering is $2 n$-approximation for $k$-median

## GreedyKCenter for $k$-median?

Use 2-approximation for $k$-center clustering (?) on $n$ points

$$
\max _{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} d(p, C) \leq \sum_{p \in P} \max _{p \in P}=n \cdot \max _{p \in P}
$$

This means:
optimal solution to $k$-center clustering is $n$-approximation for $k$-median 2 -approximation for $k$-center clustering is $2 n$-approximation for $k$-median

We can do better with local search!

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$

1: $C \leftarrow \operatorname{GreedyKCenter}(P, k)$
2: while $\exists p \in P \backslash C, c \in C$ s.t. replacing $c$ by $p$ in $C$ reduces $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ by factor $1-\tau$ :
3: $\quad C \leftarrow C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}$
4: return $C$

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$

1: $C \leftarrow \operatorname{GreedyKCenter}(P, k)$
2: while $\exists p \in P \backslash C, c \in C$ s.t. replacing $c$ by $p$ in $C$ reduces $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ by factor $1-\tau$ :
3: $\quad C \leftarrow C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}$ we choose $\tau$ later.
4: return $C$

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$

$\rightarrow$ 1: $C \leftarrow \operatorname{GreedyKCenter}(P, k)$
2: while $\exists p \in P \backslash C, c \in C$ s.t. replacing $c$ by $p$ in $C$ reduces $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ by factor $1-\tau$ :
3: $C \leftarrow C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}$
4: return $C$

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$

1: $C \leftarrow \operatorname{GreedyKCenter}(P, k)$
$\longrightarrow$ 2: while $\exists p \in P \backslash C, c \in C$ s.t. replacing $c$ by $p$ in $C$ reduces $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ by factor $1-\tau$ :
3: $\quad C \leftarrow C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}$
4: return $C$

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$

1: $C \leftarrow \operatorname{GreedyKCenter}(P, k)$
2: while $\exists p \in P \backslash C, c \in C$ s.t. replacing $c$ by $p$ in $C$ reduces $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ by factor $1-\tau$ :
$\rightarrow 3: \quad C \leftarrow C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}$
4: return $C$

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$

1: $C \leftarrow \operatorname{GreedyKCenter}(P, k)$
$\rightarrow$ 2: while $\exists p \in P \backslash C, c \in C$ s.t. replacing $c$ by $p$ in $C$ reduces $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ by factor $1-\tau$ :
3: $C \leftarrow C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}$
4: return $C$

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$

1: $C \leftarrow \operatorname{GreedyKCenter}(P, k)$
2: while $\exists p \in P \backslash C, c \in C$ s.t. replacing $c$ by $p$ in $C$ reduces $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ by factor $1-\tau$ :
$\rightarrow 3: \quad C \leftarrow C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}$
4: return $C$

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$

1: $C \leftarrow \operatorname{GreedyKCenter}(P, k)$
$\rightarrow$ 2: while $\exists p \in P \backslash C, c \in C$ s.t. replacing $c$ by $p$ in $C$ reduces $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ by factor $1-\tau$ :
3: $C \leftarrow C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}$
4: return $C$

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$

1: $C \leftarrow \operatorname{GreedyKCenter}(P, k)$
2: while $\exists p \in P \backslash C, c \in C$ s.t. replacing $c$ by $p$ in $C$ reduces $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)$ by factor $1-\tau$ :
$\rightarrow$ 3: $\quad C \leftarrow C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}$
4: return $C$


## Running time

Try swapping every $p \in P \backslash c$ with every $c \in C$ :

## Running time

Try swapping every $p \in P \backslash c$ with every $c \in C$ :
$O(n k)$ possibile swaps

## Running time

Try swapping every $p \in P \backslash c$ with every $c \in C$ :
$O(n k)$ possibile swaps
computing $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}: O(n k)$ time

## Running time

Try swapping every $p \in P \backslash c$ with every $c \in C$ :
$O(n k)$ possibile swaps
computing $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}: O(n k)$ time
time per iteration of while-loop: $O\left((n k)^{2}\right)$

## Running time

Try swapping every $p \in P \backslash c$ with every $c \in C$ :
$O(n k)$ possibile swaps
computing $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}: O(n k)$ time
time per iteration of while-loop: $O\left((n k)^{2}\right)$
number of iterations: $\log _{1 /(1-\tau)} \frac{\text { initialCost }}{\text { optimalCost }}$

## Running time

Try swapping every $p \in P \backslash c$ with every $c \in C$ :
$O(n k)$ possibile swaps
computing $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}: O(n k)$ time
time per iteration of while-loop: $O\left((n k)^{2}\right)$
number of iterations: $\log _{1 /(1-\tau)} \frac{\text { initialCost }}{\text { optimalcost }} \leq \log _{1 /(1-\tau)} 2 n \quad$ (from $2 n$-approx.)

## Running time

Try swapping every $p \in P \backslash c$ with every $c \in C$ :
$O(n k)$ possibile swaps
computing $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C \cup\{p\} \backslash\{c\}: O(n k)$ time
time per iteration of while-loop: $O\left((n k)^{2}\right)$
number of iterations: $\log _{1 /(1-\tau)} \frac{\text { initialCost }}{\text { optimalcost }} \leq \log _{1 /(1-\tau)} 2 n \quad$ (from $2 n$-approx.)
Can be simplified to $O\left(\frac{\log n}{\tau}\right)$ [without proof but elementary maths]

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$ : $(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$ : $(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median

Warning: proof tedious (but fun (?) and insightful)

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$ : $(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median

Warning: proof tedious (but fun (?) and insightful)

I will sketch the core ideas

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$ : $(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median

Warning: proof tedious (but fun (?) and insightful)
I will sketch the core ideas
I will show: if we replace until no improvement (aka: ignore $\tau$ ), we get 5-approximation

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$ : $(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Notation: } \\
& C: \text { computed centers, } C^{*} \text { opt. centers } \\
& A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right) \\
& \gamma(p)=\text { center of } p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p) \text { same in } C^{*} \\
& N(c): \text { cluster of } c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right) \text { likewise }
\end{aligned}
$$

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k):(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median
simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$


## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k):(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median
simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$


$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Notation: } \\
& C: \text { computed centers, } C^{*} \text { opt. centers } \\
& A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right) \\
& \gamma(p)=\text { center of } p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p) \text { same in } C^{*} \\
& N(c): \text { cluster of } c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right) \text { likewise }
\end{aligned}
$$

Idea: for $o \in C^{*}$ consider $C^{\prime}:=C+o-\gamma(o)$

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k):(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median
simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$


## Notation:

$C$ : computed centers, $C^{*}$ opt. centers

$$
A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right)
$$

$$
\gamma(p)=\text { center of } p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p) \text { same in } C^{*}
$$

$$
N(c): \text { cluster of } c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right) \text { likewise }
$$

Idea: for $o \in C^{*}$ consider $C^{\prime}:=C+o-\gamma(o)$
$0 \leq \operatorname{cost}(C+o-\gamma(o))-\operatorname{cost}(C)$

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k):(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median
simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$


## Notation:

$C$ : computed centers, $C^{*}$ opt. centers

$$
A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right)
$$

$$
\gamma(p)=\text { center of } p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p) \text { same in } C^{*}
$$

$$
N(c): \text { cluster of } c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right) \text { likewise }
$$

Idea: for $o \in C^{*}$ consider $C^{\prime}:=C+o-\gamma(o)$

$$
\begin{aligned}
0 & \leq \operatorname{cost}(C+o-\gamma(o))-\operatorname{cost}(C) \\
& \leq \sum_{p \in N^{*}(o)}\left(O_{p}-A_{p}\right)+\sum_{q \in N(\gamma(o))}\left(d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)-A_{q}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k):(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median
simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$


## Notation:

$C$ : computed centers, $C^{*}$ opt. centers
$A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$\gamma(p)=$ center of $p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p)$ same in $C^{*}$
$N(c)$ : cluster of $c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right)$ likewise

Idea: for $o \in C^{*}$ consider $C^{\prime}:=C+o-\gamma(o)$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& 0 \leq \operatorname{cost}(C+o-\gamma(o))-\operatorname{cost}(C) \\
& \leq \sum_{p \in N^{*}(o)}\left(O_{p}-A_{p}\right)+\sum_{q \in N(\gamma(o))}\left(d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)-A_{q}\right) \\
& \quad d\left(p, C^{\prime}\right) \leq \\
& \quad d(p, o)=O_{p}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$ : $(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$


## Notation:

$C$ : computed centers, $C^{*}$ opt. centers
$A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$\gamma(p)=$ center of $p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p)$ same in $C^{*}$
$N(c)$ : cluster of $c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right)$ likewise

Idea: for $o \in C^{*}$ consider $C^{\prime}:=C+o-\gamma(o)$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& 0 \leq \operatorname{cost}(C+o-\gamma(o))-\operatorname{cost}(C) \\
& \leq \sum_{p \in N^{*}(o)}\left(O_{p}-A_{p}\right)+\sum_{q \in N(\gamma(o))}\left(d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)-A_{q}\right) \\
& d\left(p, C^{\prime}\right) \leq \quad \text { bound cost for } q \in N(\gamma(o)) \backslash N^{*}(o) \\
& d(p, o)=O_{p} \quad \text { by taking } d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$ : $(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$


## Notation:

$C$ : computed centers, $C^{*}$ opt. centers
$A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$\gamma(p)=$ center of $p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p)$ same in $C^{*}$
$N(c)$ : cluster of $c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right)$ likewise

Idea: for $o \in C^{*}$ consider $C^{\prime}:=C+o-\gamma(o)$
$0 \leq \operatorname{cost}(C+o-\gamma(o))-\operatorname{cost}(C)$

$$
\leq \sum_{p \in N^{*}(o)}\left(O_{p}-A_{p}\right)+\sum_{q \in N(\gamma(o))}\left(d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)-A_{q}\right)
$$

by triangle ineq. (proof later): $\leq \sum_{q \in N(\gamma(o))} 2 O_{q}$
By doing this for all $o \in C^{*}$ and summing: $\sum A_{p} \leq 3 \sum O_{p}$

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$ : $(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median
simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$

proof of $d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)-A_{q} \leq 2 O_{q}$ :

## Notation:

$C$ : computed centers, $C^{*}$ opt. centers

$$
A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right)
$$

$$
\gamma(p)=\text { center of } p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p) \text { same in } C^{*}
$$

$$
N(c): \text { cluster of } c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right) \text { likewise }
$$

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k):(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median
simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$

proof of $d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)-A_{q} \leq 2 O_{q}$ :
$d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right) \leq d\left(q, \gamma^{*}(q)\right)+d\left(\gamma^{*}(q), \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)$

## Notation:

$C$ : computed centers, $C^{*}$ opt. centers
$A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right)$
$\gamma(p)=$ center of $p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p)$ same in $C^{*}$
$N(c)$ : cluster of $c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right)$ likewise

## Approximation factor

LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k):(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median
simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ :
$o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$


## Notation:

$C$ : computed centers, $C^{*}$ opt. centers

$$
A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right)
$$

$$
\gamma(p)=\text { center of } p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p) \text { same in } C^{*}
$$

$$
N(c): \text { cluster of } c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right) \text { likewise }
$$

proof of $d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)-A_{q} \leq 2 O_{q}$ :
$d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right) \leq d\left(q, \gamma^{*}(q)\right)+d\left(\gamma^{*}(q), \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)$

$$
\leq O_{q}+d\left(\gamma^{*}(q), \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)
$$

## Approximation factor

## LocalSearchKMedian $(P, k)$ : $(5+\varepsilon)$ - approximation for discrete $k$-median

 simple case: for all $o, o^{\prime} \in C^{*}$ : $o \neq o^{\prime} \rightarrow \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$

## Notation:

$C$ : computed centers, $C^{*}$ opt. centers

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A_{p}:=d(p, C), O_{p}:=d\left(p, C^{*}\right) \\
& \gamma(p)=\text { center of } p \in C, \gamma^{*}(p) \text { same in } C^{*} \\
& N(c): \text { cluster of } c \in C, N^{*}\left(c^{*}\right) \text { likewise }
\end{aligned}
$$

proof of $d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)-A_{q} \leq 2 O_{q}$ :

$$
d\left(q, \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right) \leq d\left(q, \gamma^{*}(q)\right)+d\left(\gamma^{*}(q), \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)
$$

$$
\leq O_{q}+d\left(\gamma^{*}(q), \gamma\left(\gamma^{*}(q)\right)\right)
$$

$$
\leq O_{q}+d\left(\gamma^{*}(q), \gamma(q)\right)
$$

$$
\leq O_{q}+d\left(\gamma^{*}(q), q\right)+d(q, \gamma(q))
$$

$$
=O_{q}+O_{q}+A_{q}
$$

## Approximation factor (general case)



## Approximation factor (general case)



## Approximation factor (general case)


problem: if we swap $o$ with $c:=\gamma(o)=\gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$, we can't reassign $q \in N(c) \cap N^{*}\left(o^{\prime}\right)$

## Approximation factor (general case)


problem: if we swap $o$ with $c:=\gamma(o)=\gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$, we can't reassign $q \in N(c) \cap N^{*}\left(o^{\prime}\right)$

## Approximation factor (general case)


in general

problem: if we swap $o$ with $c:=\gamma(o)=\gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$, we can't reassign $q \in N(c) \cap N^{*}\left(o^{\prime}\right)$ solution: swap $o \in C^{*}$ with $\eta(o)$ chosen s.t.

## Approximation factor (general case)


in general

problem: if we swap $o$ with $c:=\gamma(o)=\gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$, we can't reassign $q \in N(c) \cap N^{*}\left(o^{\prime}\right)$ solution: swap $o \in C^{*}$ with $\eta(o)$ chosen s.t.

$$
\eta(o)=\gamma(o) \text { if } \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right) \text { for } o \neq o^{\prime} \in C^{*}
$$

## Approximation factor (general case)

so far

in general

problem: if we swap $o$ with $c:=\gamma(o)=\gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$, we can't reassign $q \in N(c) \cap N^{*}\left(o^{\prime}\right)$ solution: swap $o \in C^{*}$ with $\eta(o)$ chosen s.t.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \eta(o)=\gamma(o) \text { if } \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right) \text { for } o \neq o^{\prime} \in C^{*} \\
& \eta(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right) \text { for all } o^{\prime} \in C^{*} \text { and } \\
& \eta(o)=\eta\left(o^{\prime}\right) \text { for at most one other } o^{\prime}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Approximation factor (general case)

so far

in general

problem: if we swap $o$ with $c:=\gamma(o)=\gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right)$, we can't reassign $q \in N(c) \cap N^{*}\left(o^{\prime}\right)$ solution: swap $o \in C^{*}$ with $\eta(o)$ chosen s.t.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \eta(o)=\gamma(o) \text { if } \gamma(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right) \text { for } o \neq o^{\prime} \in C^{*} \\
& \eta(o) \neq \gamma\left(o^{\prime}\right) \text { for all } o^{\prime} \in C^{*} \text { and } \\
& \eta(o)=\eta\left(o^{\prime}\right) \text { for at most one other } o^{\prime}
\end{aligned}
$$

Same argument works, but since we swap out each $c \in C$
up to 2 times, we get $\sum A_{p} \leq \sum O_{p}+2 \cdot 2 O_{p}$

## summary + discrete $k$-means + open problems

$k$-center: 2-approximation by greedy algorithm
discrete $k$-median: $(5+\varepsilon)$-approximation by local search

## summary + discrete $k$-means + open problems

$k$-center: 2-approximation by greedy algorithm
discrete $k$-median: $(5+\varepsilon)$-approximation by local search
discrete $k$-means: minimize $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)^{2}$

## summary + discrete $k$-means + open problems

$k$-center: 2-approximation by greedy algorithm
discrete $k$-median: $(5+\varepsilon)$-approximation by local search
discrete $k$-means: minimize $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)^{2}$
open: $\alpha$-approximation for $k$-center in $R^{d}$ with Euclidean distance and $1.82<\alpha<2$ ?

## summary + discrete $k$-means + open problems

$k$-center: 2-approximation by greedy algorithm
discrete $k$-median: $(5+\varepsilon)$-approximation by local search
discrete $k$-means: minimize $\sum_{p \in P} d(p, C)^{2}$
open: $\alpha$-approximation for $k$-center in $R^{d}$ with Euclidean distance and $1.82<\alpha<2$ ?
in my research: geometric spaces beyond points, in particular, clustering curves

